First Vice-Chair: Laurie Slade Funderburk

Katherine E. (Katie) Arrington Gary E. Clary MaryGail K. Douglas Phyllis J. Henderson Joseph H. Jefferson Jr. Mandy Powers Norrell J. Todd Rutherford Tommy M. Stringer Bill Taylor

Legislative Oversight Committee



South Carolina House of Representatives

Jennifer L. Dobson Research Director

Cathy A. Greer Administration Coordinator Post Office Box 11867 Columbia, South Carolina 29211 Telephone: (803) 212-6810 • Fax: (803) 212-6811 Room 228 Blatt Building William K. (Bill) Bowers Neal Collins Raye Felder William M. "Bill" Hixon Robert L. Ridgeway III James E. Smith Jr. Edward R. Tallon Sr. Robert Q. Williams

Charles L. Appleby IV Legal Counsel

Carmen J. McCutcheon Simon Research Analyst/Auditor

Wednesday, March 29, 2017

Secretary of Transportation Christy A. Hall South Carolina Department of Transportation Post Office Box 191 Columbia, South Carolina 29201 - 3959

Dear Secretary Hall:

Last November, the Department of Transportation provided an update on the agency's plan to address items in the April 2016 the Legislative Audit Council's April 2016 audit report. As the agency's response noted a number of items to be completed by January 31, 2017, please provide the committee with an update on the agency's implementation of the Legislative Audit Council recommendations. Again, thank you for the agency's cooperation throughout the legislative oversight process.

Sincerely,

Signature Redacted

Wm. Weston J. Newton

cc: House Legislative Oversight Committee



Christy A. Hall, P.E. Secretary of Transportation (803) 737-0874 Fax (803) 737-2038

April 19, 2017

Honorable William Weston J. Newton, Chairman South Carolina Legislative Oversight Committee South Carolina House of Representatives Post Office Box 11867 Columbia, South Carolina 29211

Dear Chairman Newton:

Please find enclosed the agency's response to your March 29, 2017 request for an update on the implementation of recommendations from the April 2016 Legislative Audit Council review. One year after receiving the results of the audit, I am proud to report that the agency has implemented approximately 85% of the recommendations made by the LAC. The remaining recommendations are either ongoing or will be implemented prior to December 31st of this year.

I trust this information is helpful and we appreciate the opportunity to provide feedback as requested. Please let me know if we can be of additional assistance.

Sincerely,



Christ, A. Nall, P.E. Secretary of Transportation

CAH:majy Enclosure



8 × ~

No.	LAC Recommendation	Agency Response	Staff Assigned	Status	Implementation Timeframe
	The General Assembly should amend SC Code 1- 30-10 to designate either the Secretary or the Commission, but not both, as the governing authority of the S.C. Department of Transportation.	Concur	NA	Addressed by Act 275 of 2016	Complete
2	The General Assembly should amend SC Code 57-1-360 to prohibit the S.C. Department of Transportation Commission from taking action that impairs the independence of the chief internal auditor or is in conflict with accepted standards as identified in the appropriate professional association pertaining to the internal audit.	Concur	State Auditor	Office of State Auditor's response: Act 275 reassigned the oversight for the Office of the Internal Auditor to the Office of the State Auditor. No further action is required.	Complete
3	The Audit Committee of the S.C. Department of Transportation should change the three revisions to the Chief Internal Auditor's position description back to the original wording.		State Auditor	Office of State Auditor's response: Act 275 reassigned the oversight for the Office of the Internal Auditor to the Office of the State Auditor. Accordingly, the position description for the Internal Auditor has been updated to comply with professional standards that support independence. Old and new pd's have been provided.	Complete
1	The S.C. Department of Transportation should require that interpretations of the statute creating and concerning the Office of the Internal Auditor be constructed and submitted through the regulatory process so that the regulations receive legislative approval.	Concur	State Auditor	Office of State Auditor's response: Act 275 reassigned the oversight for the Office of the Auditor to the Office of the State Auditor. No further action is required.	Complete
5	The General Assembly should amend SC Code 57-1-360 to include the Chief Internal Auditor's duties.	Non-concur	State Auditor	Office of State Auditor's response: Because Act 275 reassigned the oversight of the Office of the Internal Auditor to the Office of the State Auditor, the need to define the duties of the Internal Auditor in legislation no longer existed. The duties of the Internal Auditor are reflected in a revised position description. Old and new pd's have been provided.	Complete .
5	The S.C. Department of Transportation Commission's Office of the Chief Internal Auditor should conduct annual department- wide risk assessments to determine which areas within the organization to audit.	Concur	State Auditor	Office of State Auditor's response: Internal Auditor is migrating to a Enterprise Risk Management Model. The Charter for the Office of the Internal Auditor has been updated to include a reference to the development of an audit plan that correlates to the risk assessment.	Ongoing
7	The S.C. Department of Transportation Commission should consider incorporating the Corporation of Sponsoring Organizations' enterprise risk management program at the department.	Concur	SOT	Office of State Auditor's response: Internal Auditor is migrating to a Enterprise Risk Management Model.	Prior to 12/31/2017
3	The S.C. Department of Transportation Commission should reinstall the hotline under the Office of Chief Internal Auditor or ensure that the Office of the Chief Internal Auditor is aware of all complaints that are referred by the Inspector General if the hotline is not reestablished under the Office of the Chief Internal Auditor.	Concur	SOT	Secretary Hall sent an e-mail with memo to the Commission and senior staff explaining the process and asking for support of the effort. Internal Audit developed and executed a roll-out plan to ensure that all employees knew and were encouraged to use the hotline if there was suspicion of fraud, waste and abuse.	Complete
)		Concur on the creation of the position	SOT/OSA	This position has been transferred to Internal Audits.	Complete
10	The S.C. Department of Transportation should notify all employees that complaints should be directed to the Office of the Chief Internal Auditor's compliance officer or investigator.	Concur	SOT/OIA	The Secretary worked with Internal Audits, who developed and executed a roll-out plan to ensure that all employees knew and were encouraged to use the hotline if there was suspicion of fraud, waste and abuse.	Complete
11	The Office of the Chief Internal Auditor should periodically conduct a risk assessment on major IT systems at the S.C. Department of Transportation to determine any vulnerable systems that need to be audited.	Concur	State Auditor	Office of State Auditor's response: Internal Auditor is migrating to a Enterprise Risk Management Model.	Ongo'ng
12	The Office of the Chief Internal Auditor should establish a follow-up process to monitor the implementation of audit recommendations.	Concur	State Auditor	Office of State Auditor's response: The State Auditor, through the Office of the Internal Auditor, will develop a follow-up process in conjunction with management.	Complete
13	The Office of the Chief Internal Auditor should conduct follow-up audits of its BAMS-DSS and SiteManager audits.	Concur	State Auditor	Office of State Auditor's response: Follow up audits of these systems has been completed and were presented to the Commission in March 2017 and provided to required legislative Committees.	Complete
14	The S.C. Department of Transportation should seek equivalency approvals from the Division of State Human Resources for those employees who do not meet the minimum qualifications for their job class and for whom there is not an approval on file and reclassify those not approved.	Concur	Karl McCottry	HR wrote a procedure dated June 8, 2016, to ensure that equivalency approvals are obtained from the Division of State Human Resources for employees who do not meet the minimum qualifications for their job class.	Complete
15		Concur	Karl McCottry	HR submitted a formal request on July 22, 2016, to the Division of State Human Resources to review and approve the specifications to separate "engineering" and "associate engineering" positions.	Complete

No.	LAC Recommendation	Agency Response	Staff Assigned	Status	Implementation Timeframe
	The S.C. Department of Transportation's Human Resources Department should ensure that all changes to salaries include a justification.	Concur	Karl McCottry	HR wrote a procedure dated July 6, 2016, to ensure that changes to salaries include a justification and notified HR Coordinators of the new process.	Complete
17		Concur	Colvin	Encroachment permit processing times are currently an Engineering Division goal and were added to the Secretary's Monthly Management Report for publication. This measure then migrated over to the Performance Management Dashboard and will be included in the updates to the Strategic Plan and Annual Accountability Report.	Complete
	The S.C. Department of Transportation should add stronger controls to the encroachment permit processing system to prevent employees from altering dates or permit status after being set by the system.	Concur	Colvin		Complete
19	The S.C. Department of Transportation should measure and report the timeliness of completing maintenance work requests submitted by the public on a quarterly basis on the department website.	Concur	Colvin	Timelines for completing maintenance work requests is currently an Engineering Division goal and was added to the Secretary's Monthly Management Report for publication. This measure migrated over to the Performance Management Dashboard and will be included in the updates to the Strategic Plan and Annual Accountability Report.	Complete
20	capture and retain work request completion timeliness data so that performance can be	Concur	Colvin	Historical data regarding timelines for completion of maintenance work requests has been captured and trend lines will continue to be reviewed.	Complete
	measured over time. The S.C. Department of Transportation should require that any county maintenance office or district that is not meeting the target completion percentage file a plan with the Director of Maintenance to meet the goal within a defined period of time.	Concur	Colvin	The Engineering Division has developed internal goals regarding timelines for completion of maintenance work requests. County offices showing underachievement in this area will be required to develop a corrective action plan annually.	Complete
22	The S.C. Department of Transportation should implement a policy to require that any requests for assistance from a local government entity for work to be performed outside of the department's right-of-way be submitted in writing on official letterhead.	Concur	Colvin	Departmental Directive 49, dated April 8, 2016, requires requests for assistance from a local government entity for work to be performed outside of the Department's right-of-way for public benefit be submitted in writing on official letterhead.	
23	The S.C. Department of Transportation should reinstate Departmental Directive 49 addressing the prohibition of the use of departmental resources on private property and it should be applicable to all departmental employees, not just those in engineering units.	Concur	Nicholas	This directive was reinstated and signed by the Secretary of Transportation on April 8, 2016.	Complete
24	The General Assembly should add language to state statute prohibiting the use of S. C. Department of Transportation resources, including personnel and equipment, on private property unless there is a legitimate departmental purpose involved.	NA	NA	NA	NA
25	The S.C. Department of Transportation should revise Engineering Directive 34 to require that the decisions of the Value Engineering Review Committee and the alternatives considered be presented to the Secretary of Transportation and the SCDOT Commission.	Concur	Colvin	Engineering Directive 34 was revised June 23, 2016, to require that a Value Engineering Summary Report be submitted to the Secretary of Transportation and SCDOT Commission.	Complete
26	The S. C. Department of Transportation should incorporate environmental sustainability, project delivery, and organizational excellence into its current strategic plan.	Non-Concur	Patton	SCDOT agreed that project delivery and organizational excellence would be good additions to the next update of the Strategic Plan, which staff began working on in summer 2016. In the interim, project delivery and organizational performance metrics have been included in the Performance Management Dashboard.	Complete
27	The S.C. Department of Transportation should include performance measures in its strategic direction plan.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT included performance measures consistent with the Strategic Plan goals.	Complete
28	The S.C. Department of Transportation should evaluate objectives and write measurable and time-bound objectives.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has reviewed the current Annual Accountability Report and House Legislative Oversight Committee reports to establish/update objectives.	Complete
29	The S.C. Department of Transportation should create and document action steps they plan on using to meet their objectives of the strategic	Concur	Patton	In memo dated May 12, 2016, SCDOT noted the processes and steps needed in order to meet the objectives of the Strategic Plan.	Complete
30	plan. The S.C. Department of Transportation should ensure that all units create business plans according to the guidelines.	Concur	Deputies	SCDOT will issue guidance to ensure that all units create business plans consistently.	Prior to 12/31/2017
31		Concur	Nicholas/ Deputies	SCDOT will require all divisions to submit business plans to the Secretary.	Ongoing
32		Concur	Patton	SCDOT has reviewed the current Annual Accountability Report and House Legislative Oversight Committee reports to establish/update objectives.	Complete

· · ·

55

No.	LAC Recommendation	Agency Response	Staff Assigned	Status	Implementation Timeframe
33	The S.C. Department of Transportation should review performance measures to ensure that all are relevant, understandable, timely, comparable, reliable, cost-effective, useful, influential, significant, and feasible.	Concur	SOT	SCDOT will review performance measures as a part of the next update to the Strategic Plan.	Prior to 12/31/2017
34	The S.C. Department of Transportation should evaluate performance measures to ensure there are no acronyms and that measures are not written as objectives.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT spelled out all acronyms in the Strategic Plan and ensured that measures were not written as objectives.	Complete
35		Concur	SOT	SCDOT agrees that creating customer satisfaction measures would be an effective tool for monitoring organizational excellence and will include it in the next update of the Strategic Plan. These measures will be included in the Performance Management Dashboard.	Prior to 12/31/2017
36	The S.C. Department of Transportation should track and report annual safety expenditures by type of safety project or improvement.	Concur	Keys	SCDOT will track and report safety expenditures annually by project category.	Complete
37	The S.C. Department of Transportation should include in its Strategic Plan and Accountability Report performance targets for specific safety measures that reflect the department's role in statewide highway safety efforts more closely than the broad measures of statewide fatalities and injuries that are currently used.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT set specific safety performance targets that reflect the Department's role in statewide highway safety efforts and is reporting these targets and actual measures in conjunction with the Highway Safety Plan's Annual Report.	Complete
38	The S.C. Department of Transportation should implement a procedure for updating the statewide, long-range transportation plan that will allow it to abide by the five-year schedule prescribed in S.C. Regulation 63-10(B).	Concur	Patton	In memo dated July 22, 2016, SCDOT updated its process to begin the Long Range Plan update two years prior to the approval of the updated Long Range Plan to ensure the Plan is completed within the five-year schedule.	Complete
39	The S.C. Department of Transportation should update S.C. Regulation 63-10(B) to reflect the title under which the statewide, long-range transportation plan will be published.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT Commission approved the revised language as part of an update to the Regulation and it has been made available for public comment. It awaits approval by the General Assembly.	Complete but will monitor for GA action
10	The S.C. Department of Transportation should fully implement an electronic STIP preparation process and ensure that the new process provides accurate, timely, and understandable information to the public and other stakeholders.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT's electronic STIP became fully operational by October 7, 2016, with the new FY 2017-2022 STIP.	Complete
41	The S.C. Department of Transportation should track and report expenditures related to pavement maintenance and capacity-building activities separately in order to provide information crucial to long-term planning and decision making.	Concur	Keys	SCDOT posted this expenditure report on the agency's website as of June 8, 2016, and information can be found on the Finance site under Spending Transparency.	Complete
12	The S.C. Department of Transportation Commission should add the federal charge code reimbursement (Project Fund Management Group) process to the OCIA's list of risk areas to be subject to risk assessment analysis.	Concur	State Auditor	Per memo dated June 17, 2017, the federal charge code reimbursement process was added to the OIA's list of risk areas to be subject to risk assessment analysis.	Complete
43	The S.C. Department of Transportation should complete proper decision analysis, including cost-benefit analysis, for large multi-million dollar projects requiring bond issuance.	Concur	Keys	SCDOT will update its records retention policy and a Departmental Directive will be implemented addressing required analysis, documentation, and retention.	Prior to 1/31/2017
44	The S.C. Department of Transportation should keep all decision analysis documents related to projects paid for with bonds until the debt- service is paid.	Concur	Keys	SCDOT will update its records retention policy and a Departmental Directive will be implemented addressing required analysis, documentation, and retention.	Prior to 1/31/2017
45		NA	NA	NA	NA
46	The General Assembly should diversify the sources of state transportation funding in order to minimize the effect of increasing fuel economy.	NA	NA	NA	NA
47		Concur	Nicholas	SCDOT has requested that this issue be clarified through its report to the House Legislative Oversight Committee and during testimony at subsequent hearings.	Complete
48		Concur	Colvin	SCDOT provided additional training for the proper timing of pavement preservation treatments at the 2017 Maintenance Conference held March 21-23. In addition, SCDOT has increased the frequency of pavement evaluation cycles to provide more timely data. This is documented in the State Plan.	Complete
49	SCDOT should annually provide to the Commission information on the location of pavement that is about to deteriorate into the next most expensive treatment category. This information should also be disseminated to the public, the General Assembly and other stakeholders.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT will continue to provide pavement condition for each highway route category (Interstate, Primary, and Secondary) in the annual State of the Pavement Reports for public dissemination. This data will include current condition, historical trends, and forecasted conditions.	Complete

No.	LAC Recommendation	Agency Response	Staff Assigned	Status	Implementation Timeframe
50	The S.C. Department of Transportation should publically disseminate its Maintenance Assessment Program report on its website and continue to produce this report on an annual basis.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT posted the Maintenance Assessment Program report on the agency's website on June 13, 2016, and will continue to make it available on an annual basis.	Complete
51	The S.C. Department of Transportation should ensure that its information systems allow users to easily access road condition data from road maintenance contract information.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT is manually extracting pavement project information (Pavement Quality Index, project termini, and treatment information) to calculate service life added for each project road segment. This information is then included in the Pavement Management Program quarterly for access by end users. SCDOT will look for opportunities to automate this process.	Prior to 12/31/2017
52	The S.C. Department of Transportation should periodically monitor its preservation activities to determine their effectiveness level.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT currently has a research project (SPR 695) being conducted by Clemson University regarding SCDOT's Pavement Preservation program that is expected to be completed by summer 2016. SCDOT will review the research project's conclusions and implement recommendations as feasible to include monitoring pavement preservation effectiveness.	Complete
53	The S.C. Department of Transportation should periodically monitor preservation activities to ensure that the "worst first" policy is not continuing.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT will provide additional training for the proper timing cf pavement preservation treatments. In addition, the Director of Maintenance Office will continue to monitor preservation projects submitted by the Districts to ensure that those projects meet the preservation guidelines.	Ongoing
54	The S.C. Department of Transportation should analyze and document its performance in meeting ideal industry cycle times for resurfacing roads.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT will document cycle times for resurfacing projects for each highway route category (Interstate, Primary, and Secondary) as compared to industry standards noted in the LAC audit and include this information in the annual State of the Pavement report.	Complete
55	employ strategies to reduce the number of lane miles under its responsibility and consider alternatives to projects that add lane miles.	Concur	SOT	SCDOT will explore the option of developing a pilot program for devolution, but has also worked with the General Assembly to include language in the road funding bill (H. 3516) for a devolution program.	Ongoing
56	The S.C. Department of Transportation Commission should prioritize funding infrastructure preservation and maintenance.	Non-Concur	Commission	Maintenance is a priority and is reflected in more than 50% of the budget being directed towards those activities. The premise that there should be no lane miles added to the system ignores capacity issues that affect the State's economy, mobility, and air quality.	NA
57	The S.C. Department of Transportation should review and consider increasing their design standards to include heavy loads in order to minimize premature pavement maintenance.	Non-Concur	Colvin	SCDOT disagrees that it is beneficial to increase the current design standards to universally account for heavy loads. Unilaterally increasing pavement thicknesses across the state may be cost prohibitive and over-designing pavements for roads that carry little to no truck traffic. SCDOT's current design standards include maximum legal load limits, average daily traffic amounts and percent truck traffic. These factors are typically reviewed for specific routes when paving projects are planned, which may yield a thicker pavement design for a route that actually carries heavy trucks or high truck volumes.	NA
58	seek legislation to amend the fees charged to overweight trucks to offset the damage they	NA	NA	NA	NA
59		NA	NA	NA	NA
60	charged to overweight trucks. The General Assembly should review the ability of trucks to use alternative routes to bypass weigh stations.	NA	NA	NA	NA
61	When investigating project failures, the S.C. Department of Transportation should ensure that its reports timely and comprehensively address all major problems and recommend appropriate corrective actions.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT has developed a written procedure to address material or workmanship deficiencies on construction projects, including recommendations for corrective actions.	Complete
62	The S.C. Department of Transportation should develop a formal training program for employees assigned to the in-house full-depth reclamation crews.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT has partnered with the Portland Cement Association to develop a formal training program for in- house full-depth reclamation crews. Training was provided at the 2017 Maintenance Conference.	Complete
63	The S.C. Department of Transportation should develop a set of written procedures, implementing best practices, to guide the process of full-depth reclamation.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT has partnered with the Portland Cement Association to develop written procedures and best practices for full-depth reclamation.	Complete
64	The S.C. Department of Transportation should ensure that the work of full-depth reclamation crews is regularly inspected by engineering- level management to ensure best practices are being followed.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT will develop written procedures for inspection of in-house full-depth reclamation by engineering management.	Complete
65	The S.C. Department of Transportation should conduct a comprehensive study of the costs associated with the in-house full-depth reclamation crews and contracted full-depth reclamation work to determine whether cost savings are being realized.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT will conduct a comprehensive cost study to compare in-house full-depth reclamation with contracted full-depth reclamation.	Prior to 12/31/2017

· · · ·

с. С

No.	LAC Recommendation	Agency Response	Staff Assigned	Status	Implementation Timeframe
6	have an independent expert analyze fairly newly paved roads exhibiting roughness, seams, and pitting, etc. to determine the cause and take corrective action as necessary.	Non-Concur	Colvin	SCDOT had its technical experts and industry partners review the sites of concern as identified by the LAC. However, they could not determine specific sites based on information provided to the LAC. SCDOT has asked for the source of information to reach out for assistance in locating the areas.	Prior to 12/31/2017
57	The S.C. Department of Transportation should consider development of a focus group of in- house experts to develop and implement a plan to monitor pavement quality and address pavement issues contributing to shortened pavement life.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT developed a written procedure to address material or workmanship deficiencies on construction projects, including recommendations for corrective actions. The reports addressing material or workmanship deficiencies will be provided to the Director of Construction and the State Highway Engineer.	Complete
8	The General Assembly should amend S.C. Code of Laws 57-1-370(B)(8) to specify whether all nine criteria listed in the section are to be used when ranking projects.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA
59	The S.C. Department of Transportation should document its consideration of Act 114 criteria for each project category.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed an over-arching project prioritization directive that will include procedural guidelines related to the process utilized to rank both state and federal Act 114 prioritized projects. This includes a clear, transparent description of the ranking process for each project category, the relevant criteria used in that category and why, and a detailed description as to how to access the raw data used to develop the priority list scores.	Complete
70	The S.C Department of Transportation should document in S.C. Regulation 63-10 and in its engineering directives the rationale for any criteria that it determines are not relevant, as well as, for any additional criteria it uses and update these documents whenever modifications are made.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation. Additionally, this has been included in Regulation 4683 currently pending before the General Assembly.	Complete
71	The S.C. Department of Transportation should update in S.C. Regulation 63-10 and its engineering directives to reflect its complete prioritization methodologies and update them whenever modifications are made.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation. Additionally, this has been included in Regulation 4683 currently pending before the General Assembly.	Comp ete
2	The S.C. Department of Transportation should only use criteria to prioritize projects that have been approved by the Commission.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Comp ete
73	The S.C. Department of Transportation should perform lifecycle cost analyses on all roadway new location, widening, and capacity projects and that this criterion be incorporated into the ranking process in accordance with Act 114.	Non-Concur	Patton	SCDOT believes a better measurement of financial viability would be to compare the agency's ability to fund the project with "reasonable availability of funding," similar to the requirements the Federal Highway Administration expects for inclusion into the STIP.	NA
74	The S.C. Department of Transportation should comply with SC Regulation 63-10 and defer the development of any future priority lists until an engineering directive has been issued.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
75	The S.C. Department of Transportation should place all Commission-approved priority lists on its website.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has ensured that all active priority ranking lists are posted on the agency's website.	Complete
76		Non-Concur	Colvin	Engineering Directives are issued by the position, not the person. Approval by the Commission is not necessary because Engineering Directives are strictly administrative guidance, not policy decisions.	
77	The S.C. Department of Transportation should specify in its SC Regulation 63-10 and directives which software systems are used in prioritizing projects and how the data is inputted and used by those systems in calculating project rankings.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT disagrees that specifying a particular software system in Regulation is beneficial to the overall process. However, SCDOT agrees that specificity on the process for data handling and has included it in a project prioritization directive that has been developed.	Complete
78	The S.C. Department of Transportation should ensure that it archives all data and information relevant to justifying prioritization rankings of projects.	Concur	Colvin/ Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
79		Concur	Colvin/ Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
80	The S.C. Department of Transportation should test the validity of all data it uses to calculate prioritization scores.	Concur	Colvin/ Patton	SCDOT will explore available options to validate the most critical data used in the ranking process.	Complete
31		Concur	Colvin/ Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
82	The S.C. Department of Transportation should review its normalization of prioritization criteria to ensure the process results in the appropriate score for the criteria.	Non-Concur	Colvin/ Patton	SCDOT has reviewed its normalization of prioritization criteria and all criteria are normalized except PQI. There is no need to normalize (set to a 0 to 5 scale) PQI scores, as the scores already match exactly with a 0 to 5 scale.	NA

No.	LAC Recommendation	Agency Response	Staff Assigned	Status	Implementation Timeframe
	The S.C. Department of Transportation should examine its financial viability prioritization scoring to account for the possibility of funding larger projects.	Non-Concur	Patton	SCDOT believes a better measurement of financial viability would be to compare the agency's ability to fund the project with "reasonable availability of funding," similar to the requirements the Federal Highway Administration expects for inclusion into the STIP. However, SCDOT is seeking to modify it through Regulation 4683 which is currently being considered by the General Assembly.	Complete
4	The S.C. Department of Transportation should ensure that its engineering directives specifically detail how each prioritization criteria is used to generate prioritization lists.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
5	The S.C. Department of Transportation should calculate new priority list scores when criteria, weightings, and related data changes; if this results in a change in ranking, the list should be submitted to the Commission for approval.	Non-Concur	Colvin/ Patton	Update Cycles will be included in an Act 114 Process Engineering Directive.	NA
6	The S.C. Department of Transportation should comply with Engineering Directive 56 and include the top ranked 75 segments on its interstate capacity priority list.	Non-Concur	Patton	SCDOT will modify Engineering Directive 56 to eliminate the reference to "75 segments." All future interstate widening lists will evaluate the entire interstate system, not segments.	NA
7	The S.C. Department of Transportation should acquire approval from the Commission or other designated authority for all priority lists as required by Act 114.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
38	The S.C. Department of Transportation should clearly identify when criteria and weights have been approved by the Commission in a centralized location on its website with its priority lists by including the Commission action approving the change(s) and the relevant page number(s). We further recommend that when changes have been made to the prioritization process, SCDOT should clearly reference both the old and new Commission actions for comparison so that the public can determine what changed.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation. SCDOT's web page has been updated.	Complete
9	The S.C. Department of Transportation should comply with Act 114 and establish a single priority list of projects that addresses all Act 114 criteria and informs stakeholders of the paramount needs of South Carolina's infrastructure.	Non-Concur	Patton	A single statewide ranking list would not be consistent with the funding categories and the restrictions on funds that are flowing to SCDOT both at the state and federal level. Additionally, a single statewide ranking list would create an equity issue, especially with the rural counties, regarding the distribution of paving funds across the entire state. SCDOT agrees that significant improvements need to be made with regards to how the agency provides information on funding and priorities within those funding categories to the public, Commission and other stakeholders.	NA
0	The S.C. Department of Transportation should make its project prioritization process fully transparent and easily understandable for the public.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation. SCDOT's web page has been updated.	Complete
91	The S.C. Department of Transportation should review its project priority lists and its website to determine if errors are present and update information accordingly.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT will periodically review the website information to ensure accuracy and will be one of the requirements in an Act 114 Process Engineering Directive.	Complete
92	The S.C. Department of Transportation should comply with Act 114 and S.C. Regulation 63-10 and prioritize all federal and non-federal aid projects under the scope of Act 114 and include their rankings in the STIP.	Non-Concur	Colvin	The Act 114 prioritized federal aid projects are included in the STIP. The non-federal aid projects are actually reflected in the State Program. SCDOT agrees that significant improvements need to be made with regards to how the agency provides information to the public, Commission and others, on funding and priorities within these two programmatic areas (federal and state).	NA
3	The S.C. Department of Transportation should comply with Act 114 and prioritize maintenance projects related to preservation of roads.	Non-Concur	Colvin	Preservation projects are selected by SCDOT engineers based on actual condition of the road at the time and treatments are applied at different levels of pavement deterioration.	NA
14	The S.C. Department of Transportation should comply with S.C. Regulation 63-10 and provide the full methodologies for ranking projects in its directives, ensuring this is done in a manner that is easily comprehended by the public.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
95	The S.C. Department of Transportation should comply with Regulation 63-10 and include the applicable weights for each criterion in its engineering directives.	Concur	Colvin/ Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
16		Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed performance measures to check that the criteria and weightings for the priority lists are meeting the agency's goals.	Complete
97	The S.C. Department of Transportation should develop goals for all non-federally funded projects and include this information in the State Program.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT's Transportation Asset Management Plan (TAMP) will establish goals for road and bridges. These goals will apply to projects included in the State Program.	Prior to 12/31/201

s.,≛*

`

No.	LAC Recommendation	Agency Response	Staff Assigned	Status	Implementation Timeframe
8	The S.C. Department of Transportation should develop performance measures to test how successful projects were in achieving goals and provide this information to the public and the Commission.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed performance measures to determine how successful the priority lists are meeting the agency's goals.	Complete
9	The S.C. Department of Transportation should make its project prioritization process fully transparent and easily understandable for the public.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation. SCDOT's web page has been updated.	Complete
.00	the second	Concur	Patton	SCDOT utilized the Call Center as the central point of contact for questions about prioritization and placed that information on the website.	Complete
.01	The S.C. Department of Transportation should place all of its related project prioritization documentation in a centralized location on its website for public dissemination.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation. SCDOT's web page has been updated.	Complete
.02	The S.C. Department of Transportation should consider establishing a centralized office for prioritization.	Concur	Patton	Per memo dated July 2, 2016, SCDOT designated the Planning Office as the centralized office for coordinating prioritization functions.	Complete
.03	The S.C. Department of Transportation should provide the final project scores on the priority lists and submit them to the Commission.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
104	The S.C. Department of Transportation should provide all of its data and project-ranking calculations publicly on its website and when soliciting public comment on its priority lists and in a manner that allows for easy interpretation of the methodologies and resulting scores.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation. SCDOT's web page has been updated.	Complete
.05	The Commission should provide written justification for any and all deviations from the project priority ranking list and the specific circumstances under S.C. Regulation 63-10 under which the deviation was justified. Also, these justifications should be clearly referenced on the project priority list and in the Statewide Transportation Improvement Program.	Concur	Keys/Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
06	The S.C. Department of Transportation should modify its project priority ranking lists to standardize its formats and the information	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
07	contained thereon. The S.C. Department of Transportation should provide the status of the projects contained on the project priority lists for all of the lists and include a timeframe on the list for when the statuses of the projects are updated.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
.08	The General Assembly may wish to evaluate the specifics of the ability of the S.C. Department of Transportation Commission to override Act 114 prioritization requirements.	NA	Patton	NA	NA
09	The S.C. Department of Transportation should identify and date projects that have been programmed into the STIP.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
10		Concur	Colvin/ Patton	SCDOT has added the fiscal year to all priority lists.	Complete
11		Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
.12	include documentation of FHWA's and FTA's approvals, referred to as the <i>planning finding</i> ,	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has included the planning finding on the STIP web page.	Complete
13	in the STIP on its website. The S.C. Department of Transportation should provide direct links to all of the MPO TIPs on its website.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has ensured that all MPO TIPs are on the STIP web page.	Complete
14	The S.C. Department of Transportation should indicate who sponsors projects in the State Transportation Improvement Program and specify the sources of project funding.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT explored options for including descriptions of local funding dedicated to a project within the STIP.	Complete
.15	define all acronyms in the STIP.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has ensured all acronyms are spelled out on the STIP web page.	Complete
.16	The S.C. Department of Transportation should provide detailed explanation in the STIP regarding how other entities can request additional funding and how it is used.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has updated the STIP introduction narrative to explain the funding process.	Complete
.17	The S.C. Department of Transportation should list the specific source(s) of local funding.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has explored options and included descriptions of local funding dedicated to a project within the STIP.	Complete
18	The S.C. Department of Transportation should incorporate a financial plan into the Statewide Transportation Improvement Program.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has explored and implemented options for clearly describing project financial plans within the STIP.	Complete

No.	LAC Recommendation	Agency Response	Staff Assigned	Status	Implementation Timeframe
	The S.C. Department of Transportation should break down STIP project funding between federal and state dollars when listing the sources of these funds for each phase of the project.	Concur	Patton	On October 7, 2016, SCDOT more clearly described funding details for program categories within the STIP.	Complete
20		Concur	Patton	SCDOT has updated its web page to clarify which is the current STIP versus archived versions.	Complete
.21	The S.C. Department of Transportation should consider providing the Statewide Transportation Improvement Program in	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has made services available that provide Spanish translation of the STIP.	Complete
.22	Spanish. The S.C. Department of Transportation should consider implementing a longer comment period to allow the public and stakeholders more time to comment on proposed Commission actions.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has added an additional week to the comment period.	Complete
.23	The S.C. Department of Transportation should conduct public meetings regarding its Statewide Transportation Improvement Program.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT worked with FHWA and changed its public engagement plan.	Complete
.24		Concur	Patton	SCDOT has added priority rankings to all of the projects within the STIP and posted them on the website.	Complete
.25	The S.C. Department of Transportation should include narratives in the STIP for each project that include, at a minimum, the purpose and	Concur	Patton	SCDOT published within the STIP the purpose and need for all funding categories.	Complete
.26	need for each project. The S.C. Department of Transportation should include information in the STIP on how to contact the department with questions.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has identified 1-855-GO-SCDOT as the call number for questions regarding the STIP and placed this information on the website.	Complete
127	The S.C. Department of Transportation should make project National Environmental Policy Act "Purpose and Need" statements publicly available in a centralized location on its website in a manner that allows for easy project identification.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT published within the STIP the purpose and need for all funding categories.	Complete
.28	The S.C. Department of Transportation should continue to improve the presentation of the information in its STIP so as to be more informative to the public and stakeholders.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has explored other state's STIP documents for tools that could assist with the interpretation of the STIP information and has streamlined the STIP to make it easier to understand.	Complete
29	The S.C. Department of Transportation should include in the STIP more assistive tools for interpreting the information it contains.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has explored other state's STIP documents for tools that could assist with the interpretation of the STIP information and has streamlined the STIP to make it easier to understand.	Complete
.30	The S.C. Department of Transportation should identify in the STIP anything that is not defined, such as highlighting of project information.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT added a note in the old STIP to clarify the purpose of any highlighting used. As agreed upon on May 17, 2016, the e-STIP would no longer use highlighting.	Complete
131	The S.C. Department of Transportation should include information related to the project priority ranks on the map on its website.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT will review other state DOT web pages to explore options for posting priority rankings in a clear manner, but is also exploring the use of SCDOT's Project Viewer to address this recommendation.	Prior to 12/31/201
132	The S.C. Department of Transportation Commission should discontinue providing non- required funding to metropolitan planning organizations and councils of governments.	Concur	Keys/Patton	The SCDOT Commission will explore options on efficiently utilizing the funding distributed to MPOs and COGs.	Prior to 12/31/201
133	The S.C. Department of Transportation Commission should discontinue providing state funds to transportation management areas.	Non-Concur	Keys	The SCDOT Commission believes that SCDOT should be responsible for providing the State match for the TMAs since their work is on the State System. Routes within TMA areas owned by cities or counties would be matched by those entities and not the State.	NA
134	The S.C. Department of Transportation should consider strategies to transfer future maintenance costs of projects to the entities that sponsor the projects.	Non-Concur	Keys	The SCDOT Commission believes that unless sufficient funding accompanies the transfer, as well as the requirement to prioritize maintenance of these roadways, they should remain within the State's area of responsibility as they are State roads.	NA
135	The S.C. Department of Transportation should periodically audit the application of COGs' and MPOs' prioritization processes to ensure	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has developed a project prioritization directive to address this recommendation.	Complete
136	proper applications. The S.C. Department of Transportation should mandate that all COGs and MPOs use the statewide ranking criteria specified under Act 114 if receiving non-required funding from SCDOT.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has discussed Act 114 criteria modification with the relevant MPO/COG programs to modify their criteria to the statewide criteria if receiving funds outsic e the TMA attributable amounts.	Complete
137	The S.C. Department of Transportation should provide links to COG TIPs or provide the documents themselves in a centralized location on its website for easy accessibility.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has ensured all COG TIPs are properly link ad on the agency's website.	Complete
138	The S.C. Department of Transportation should update the links on its website to provide all of the MPO TIPs and to periodically review and update the links as necessary to ensure the public has easy access to these documents.	Concur	Patton	SCDOT has ensured all MPO TIPs are properly lin (ed on the agency's website.	Complete

1.5.5.8

8

No.	LAC Recommendation	Agency Response	Staff Assigned	Status	Implementation Timeframe
.39	The S.C. Department of Transportation should consider revising its regulations to allow it to determine whether a business affiliated with a trust that benefits a close family member of a debarred party should be denied	Concur	Nicholas	H. 4056 was considered by the General Assembly and would have addressed this, but did not pass.	NA
140	prequalification. The S.C. Department of Transportation should monitor prequalified businesses that are affiliated with trusts that benefit close family members of debarred parties to ensure that debarred parties do not engage in unauthorized activities in South Carolina.	Concur	Keys/Colvin	H. 4056 was considered by the General Assembly and would have addressed this, but did not pass.	NA
.41	In its notices of revocation of prequalification to businesses, the S.C. Department of Transportation should state the basis for its revocations, include findings supporting the revocations, and inform affected businesses of any rights to an administrative hearing or other recourse.	Concur	Colvin	Existing contractor pre-qualification procedures provide basis for any revocation and inform affected contractors of any rights to an administrative hearing or other recourse.	Complete
42	The S.C. Department of Transportation should consider options to verify, independently, the answers provided by contractors in their prequalification applications.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT will utilize the Office of External Audits to provide a risk-based approach to verify contractor pre- qualification applications.	Complete
143	The S.C. Department of Transportation should ensure that the reason for any reversals of the contract administration engineer's initial decisions regarding the prequalification of contractors is sufficiently documented.	Concur	Colvin/Keys	Existing contractor pre-qualification procedures ensure that documentation is provided for any reversals regarding pre-qualifications.	Complete
.44	The S.C. Department of Transportation should review its policies and procedures for maintaining the confidentiality of engineers' estimates and other confidential information periodically, but at least annually.	Concur	Colvin	Engineering has established a policy to address handling confidential information.	Complete
145	The S.C. Department of Transportation should evaluate the performance of warm mixed asphalt technology and require its use where its use is effective and will allow for greater competition among asphalt producers.	Non-Concur	Colvin	SCDOT does not agree that requiring warm mix technology allows for greater competition. SCDOT believes that its required use would reduce competition, as this assumes that all asphalt producers have warm mix capability and that each producer that has the capability would elect to run warm mix to meet a project specific requirement.	NA
146	The S.C. Department of Transportation should maximize its use of analysis to detect bid rigging and collusion and expand opportunities for competition in the letting process.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT is taking a risk-based approach for the detection of bid rigging and will re-implement an annual report prepared by the Director of Construction Office.	Ongoing - one year of data is needed fo a thorough analysis
147	The S.C. Department of Transportation should expand its efforts to broaden participation in its lettings so as to increase the level of competition in the marketplace.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT agrees that more competition is desirable, but is unsure how to increase participation by willing and able bidders. Industry has indicated business decisions are based on sustainable revenue sources dedicated to transportation infrastructure. The economics of supply and demand generally drive competition.	NA
.48	The S.C. Department of Transportation should complete work on a design-build manual.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT has completed its design-build manual, "Design- Build Projects Procurement and Contract Administration Guidelines."	Complete
.49	The S.C. Department of Transportation should implement a system to allow for online bid submissions for design-build projects.	Non-Concur	Colvin	After review of options, a process that provides for greater transparency was put in place. Bids are now opened in public and the apparent low bidder is announced at that time.	NA
150	The S.C. Department of Transportation should implement a system for analyzing bids on design-build projects to detect collusion, bid rigging, and other activity that undermines the integrity of the bidding process.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT has documented the process for bid analysis of design-build projects in its design-build manual. The design-build bid is a lump sum bid that includes all items of work within the defined project scope. There is no need to review a lump sum design-build bid for front loading or unbalanced bids, as SCDOT has none of the risks associated with these items.	Complete
151	The S.C. Department of Transportation should complete a valid comparative evaluation of the design-build approach to project delivery and the design-bid-build approach to determine its impact on cost and quality when compared to the design-bid-build approach to project delivery.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT will complete a valid comparative evaluation of the design-build approach versus the traditional design- bid-build approach to include cost, schedule and quality. This study has been included in a research project that is still underway.	Ongoing
152		Concur	Keys	SCDOT revised its Notices to All Consulting firms to require full formal names on submittals.	Complete
153	The S.C. General Assembly should address the potential confusion in S.C. Code 11-35-310(22) which is referenced in S.C. Code 8-13-760 regarding the definition of "participating directly in procurement"	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA
154	directly in procurement." The General Assembly should amend S.C. Code 12-28-2740 to establish terms of office and minimum qualifications for members of county transportation committees.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA

No.	LAC Recommendation	Agency Response	Staff Assigned	Status	Implementation Timeframe
	regularly review the fee structure to ensure that fees collected reflect actual costs incurred in the administration of the C Program and its findings should be reviewed by an outside entity.	Concur	Colvin/Keys	SCDOT will review the CTC fee structure every two years to ensure that the fees collected reflect actual costs incurred by the Department.	Ongoing - one year of data is needed for a thorough analysis
	The S.C. Department of Transportation should implement a process to track time spent by all employees on C Program-related duties to properly capture associated costs.	Concur	Colvin/Keys	SCDOT provided supplemental guidance to agency employees June 30, 2016 that Department Directive 48, "Documentation of SCDOT Employee Chargeable Hours," includes CTC projects.	Complete
	The General Assembly should amend S.C. Code 12-28-2740 to specify the types of projects that are ineligible to receive C Funds such as parking lots and other non-road or non-bridge improvements that are not related to safety or traffic improvements.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA
	The General Assembly should amend S.C. Code 12-28-2740 to require the County Transportation Committees to provide details of the projects in their plans and prioritize the projects for the countywide transportation plan.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA
159	The General Assembly should amend S.C. Code 12-28-2740 to require the County Transportation Committees to develop, at a minimum, a two-year transportation plan and make the plan conspicuous to the public.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA
	The General Assembly should amend S.C. Code 12-28-2740 to require the County Transportation Committees to advertise meetings on their county websites at the beginning of each calendar year.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA
161	The General Assembly should amend S.C. Code 12-28-2740 to require any county receiving C Program funds to have a transportation plan posted on its website.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA
162	The S.C. Department of Transportation should provide the countywide transportation plans on its website.	Concur	Colvin	CTC Transportation Plans were placed on SCDOT's website on April 11, 2016.	Complete
163	The General Assembly should amend S.C. Code 12-28-2740 to require an annual report for all 46 County Transportation Committees to be prepared and compiled into an annual statewide report submitted to the General Assembly.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA
164	The S.C. Department of Transportation should document C Program Fund expenditures on a per-project basis in a report for all County Transportation Committees that are administered by the S.C. Department of Transportation.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT will publish annual reports on all CTC expenditures, not just self-administered CTCs. Data for all CTCs is being collected for FY16/17, and first publication is expected January 2018.	Ongoing
165	The SC Department of Transportation should collect and use data to compare resurfacing project costs with those incurred by county governments to determine if cost savings could be realized by either the department or county governments to complete transportation projects.	Concur	Colvin	SCDOT will perform a multi-year cost comparison study for resurfacing projects. The agency concurs with the LAC report that there is no clear evidence that either SCDOT or county governments can complete resurfacing for lower costs based on currently available data. Life cycle cost analysis will be considered.	Prior to 12/31/2017
166	The General Assembly should amend S.C. Code 12-28-2740 to require that county transportation committees submit detailed project invoices before payments are approved by the S.C. Department of Transportation C Program administration office.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA
167	The General Assembly should amend S.C. Code 12-28-2740 to require that programming requests submitted to the S.C. Department of Transportation by county transportation committees include specific project details such as road segments and mileages.		Nicholas	NA	NA
168	The General Assembly should repeal the S.C. Department of Transportation's exemption from the S.C. Consolidated Procurement Code.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA
169	The S.C. Department of Transportation should implement a written policy to receive and investigate protests made regarding its exemption from the S.C. Consolidated Procurement Code.	Concur	Keys	SCDOT updated its Procurement Manual to include a protest procedure.	Complete
170	The General Assembly should amend state law to authorize an independent authority to investigate protests related to the S.C. Department of Transportation's exempted procurements.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA

No.	LAC Recommendation	Agency Response	Staff Assigned	Status	Implementation Timeframe
171	The General Assembly should amend state law to specify who administers penalties against the S.C. Department of Transportation for violations pertaining to its exemption from the S.C. Consolidated Procurement Code and under which section of law(s) they are to be administered.	NA	Nicholas.	NA	NA.
172	The General Assembly should amend S.C. Code 57-1-490 such that Materials Management Office's reviews of the S.C. Department of Transportation's exemption from the S.C. Procurement Code be conducted every five years, but discontinued after ten years if those reviews are without significant findings.	NA	Nicholas	NA	NA

9 a.

• 1